

## **I. Announcements**

***A. Email requirement—some but not all have met this. Do it soon!  
No need to wait! Good job to most everyone!***

***B. Mea culpa re: Tim and assuming something wrong.***

## **II. What I wanted to do last time**

***A. Make clear that what we study has a scientific basis—it's not just feelings or beliefs***

***B. Be clear that the course does two things***

**1. Introduce the policy process and seek to explain how policy is made**

**2. Outlines how we study the policy process. And the things we talk about here are relevant to your careers as citizens and as students of public policy or any body of knowledge.**

***C. Other things to remember***

**1. Policy studies are very much rooted in politics**

**2. Yet, it's not just political scientists that study public policy**

**3. The study of public policy dates to the middle of the 20th century**

a) In the 1940s and 1950s, a shift away from institutions and toward individual behavior.

b) Thus, the two main traditions in political science: institutionalism and behaviorism.

c) A bit of this is reflected in Stone, but not much.

## **III. Today's main topic: Introducing Stone's Policy Paradox**

***A. Why did I assign Stone's book?***

***B. Why did I assign Policy Paradox?***

**1. It is important to understand how policies pose "paradoxes"**

**2. What is a paradox?**

***C. Paradox, defined (don't write all this down!)***

**1. 1 : a tenet contrary to received opinion**

**2 a : a statement that is seemingly contradictory or opposed**

**to common sense and yet is perhaps true b : a self-contradictory statement that at first seems true c : an argument that apparently derives self-contradictory conclusions by valid deduction from acceptable premises 3 : one that possesses seemingly contradictory qualities or phases**

**2. (courtesy of [www.merriam-webster.com](http://www.merriam-webster.com))**

***D. What paradoxes does Stone want to explain?***

- 1. Why policy making appears “irrational”**
- 2. Why political science so prizes “rationality” at the expense of better theories of how the policy process works.**

***E. Why did Stone write her book?***

- 1. She found something pretty shocking in “policy science.”**

a) “The new field of policy science, supposedly devoted to improving governance, was based on a profound disgust for the ambiguities and paradoxes of politics. By and large, the new science dismissed politics as an unfortunate obstacle to clear-headed, rational analysis and good policy (which were the same thing).” (pp. x-xi)

- 2. “I believe rationality is a narrow conception...and that we are often forced to entertain paradox.”**

- 3. “The field of policy analysis is dominated by economics and its model of society as a market.”**

- 4. “ Political science hasn’t found a very convincing or satisfying explanation of how policy gets made.”**

- 5. “The fields of public policy and policy**

- 6. analysis worship objectivity and determinate rules.”**

- 7. Thus, in the end, politics is much more complex, fluid, and potentially paradoxical than we might think it is**

a) But it’s only paradoxical if we keep forcing our own sense of rationality onto a process that may have a logic, but not that of the “rationality project”

***F. Why do you think policy analysis is so afraid of politics?***

- 1. because it isn’t neat, tidy, and easily subject to “science”**

***G. The Market and the Polis***

**1. How can we model the ways societies organize to act politically?**

**2. We will go through this because I want you to understand the important features of her argument.**

**3. What is a market?**

a) "A social system in which individuals pursue their own welfare by exchanging things with others whenever trades are *mutually beneficial*."

b) Is this a good description of how politics works in the United States and other democracies?

**4. What are the assumptions of a market system**

a) Individual interest and benefit

b) One to one exchanges

c) Perfect information

d) Mutual benefit (not a zero sum game)

**5. Problems with the market model**

a) Markets are not about the public interest

b) Politics and policy making is often not voluntary

c) There is rarely good information available to all in politics (or in markets, actually)

d) Because one doesn't need community for market exchanges—but for the commons politics is an absolute necessity.

**6. Thus, the polis**

a) From the Greek word for "city-state"

b) It is also the root of our words "politics" and "policy"

c) Stone uses it to mean a relatively small political community, although the example works at a larger scale as well.

## ***H. What Are the Important Features of a Political Community?***

### **1. Community**

- a) Much more complex than a simplified "Robinson Crusoe" society.
- b) Much debate in politics and policy is about who is a member of the community
  - (1) Illegal immigrants***
  - (2) Young people who could go to war but not vote.***
- c) The differences between *political* and *cultural* communities

Resume here

### **2. Features of a Political Community**

- a) Public Interest
  - (1) Is it individual goals held in common?***
  - (2) Is it goal consensus?***
  - (3) Is it things that are good for the community as a community?***
  - (4) We've noted before that there is no one public interest***
  - (5) Yet, much of politics is an appeal to a claimed public interest***
  - (6) Thus, whether it exists or not, the public interest is important because people believe it is.***
- b) Commons Problems
  - (1) Actions with private benefits that entail social costs***
  - (2) Social benefits that require private sacrifices***
    - (a) Tax payments to schools**
    - (b) President Bush's claim for a need for voluntarism**

***(3) The challenge: getting people to forgo benefits or to accept some sacrifice for the broader good.***

**(a) This describes Collective Action Problems.**

c) Influence

***(1) People are subject to influence, and are not just utility maximizing actors***

***(2) The challenge is to create a system that allows for influence but doesn't become coercive in the most negative sense.***

d) Cooperation

***(1) People have to cooperate in political systems of greater than 2 people***

***(2) This is the essence of politics***

***(3) Markets don't require cooperation: they rely on voluntary exchange relationships that come and go.***

e) Loyalty

***(1) In the market, each transaction is assumed to be a unique, one-shot event***

***(2) Involves friends, commitments, longer term relationships between people and groups.***

***(3)***

f) Groups

***(1) The building block of politics***

***(2) Held together by loyalty***

***(3) Wield power through influence***

g) Information

***(1) In the market, assumed to be "perfect" and open***

*(2) In the polis, assumed not to be in the open—  
groups try to find and discredit some information,  
while profiting from other information.*

h) Passion

*(1) Authority and interest grow with use*

*(2) In the market, resources shrink*

i) Power

*(1) Derived from all other features*

*(2) A phenomenon of communities*

*(3) Exists to subordinate individual interests to group  
interests.*

*(4)*

***I. Concepts of Society [table] page 33***

[Concepts of Society.ppt](#)

***J.***